



**Maryland Longitudinal Data System Governing Board
Meeting Minutes - December 8, 2023**

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on December 8, 2023, via teleconference. Mr. Jason Perkins-Cohen, designee for vice-chair, Secretary Portia Wu, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

The following Governing Board members were in attendance:

- Mr. Jason Perkins-Cohen, Deputy Secretary, Maryland Department of Labor (Designee for Secretary Wu)
- Dr. Sanjay Rai, Acting Secretary of Higher Education and Dr. Barbara Schmertz, Director of Research and Policy Analysis, Maryland Higher Education Commission (Designee for Secretary Rai)
- Ms. Chandra Haislet, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Assessment, Accountability, and Performance Reporting, Maryland State Department of Education (Designee for Superintendent Choudhury)
- Mr. Shane Hall, Assistant Director of Research and Evaluation, Department of Juvenile Service (Designee for Secretary Schiraldi)
- Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach, University System of Maryland (Designee for Dr. Jay Perman, Chancellor)
- Mr. Matt Power, President, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association and Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice-President (Designee for President Power)
- Dr. Monica Randall, Deputy Executive Director, Maryland Association of Community Colleges (Designee for Dr. Brad Phillips, Director)
- Dr. Phyllis Keys, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs, Morgan State University (Designee for President Wilson)
- Mr. Jason Dykstra, Chief Accountability Officer, Instructional Data Division, Anne Arundel County Public Schools
- Ms. Hussainatu Blake, Education and Workforce Strategist, Patrick J. McGovern Foundation
- Mr. Rudy Anthony, CyberSecurity and Identity Management Subject Matter Expert
- Dr. Susan Sterett, Professor of Public Policy, University of Maryland, Baltimore County

The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:

- Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
- Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
- Dr. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center, and MHEC Liaison
- Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator, MLDS Center, and MSDE Liaison
- Ms. Tejal Cherry, Chief Information Office, MLDS Center
- Mr. Roy Enehiroana, Data Analyst, MLDS Center, and Labor Liaison
- Ms. Jeaneen Johnson, Assistant Attorney General

Approval of the Meeting Minutes

Mr. Perkins-Cohen asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the September 8, 2023 meeting. Mr. Power made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Mr. Dykstra. The motion was unanimously approved.

New Business

Mr. Goldstein explained that Mr. Power has asked for the Governing Board to consider the possible participation by the MLDS Center with the U.S. Census Bureau on its Post-Secondary Employment Outcomes (PSEO) project. PSEO provides earnings and employment outcomes for college and university graduates by degree level, degree major, and post-secondary institution. These statistics are generated by matching university transcript data with a national database of jobs, using state-of-the-art confidentiality protection mechanisms to protect the underlying data. Post-secondary employment outcomes are only provided if a state or college or university in the state provides the Census Bureau with student transcript level data. Currently, neither the State of Maryland nor any colleges within the State of Maryland are participating in the project. Mr. Power is interested in the MLDS Center providing data to the Census Bureau for participation with PSEO, noting that: (a) participation will allow colleges and universities to have a fuller understanding of their graduates' workforce outcomes because it will be able to match graduates to national workforce data sources that are not available to the MLDS Center; (b) 27 other states participate at some level (publics, and/or independents, and/or community colleges); and (c) PSEO provides geographical information that allows users to see degree to industry sector and the geography of where graduates work by major.

Mr. Power noted that with so many other states utilizing this service, MICUA institutions are interested in also participating and having an expanded view of the workforce outcomes of their students. Mr. Power is interested in finding a legislator to sponsor a bill that would authorize, but not require, the Center to provide data to the Census Bureau to allow full participation with PSEO. Mr. Power then showed examples of the information provided by PSEO. Finally, Mr. Power noted that he wanted to gauge whether there are any strong objections to participation with PSEO. If not, Mr. Power indicated that he will work to remove the first hurdle, which is seeking a legislative change to allow the Center to redisclose data for this limited purpose.

Dr. Rai noted that understanding postsecondary student outcomes is an issue that all of higher education is looking at and will help provide a better understanding of the return on investment of higher education.

Dr. Rai also noted that his preference would be to have this type of information for all different types of credentials.

Mr. Power responded that sharing data with the Census Bureau would be highly secure and the data would only be used for this one purpose. Mr. Goldstein added that PSEO only works with college graduate data and that the MLDS would not be getting any data back from the Census Bureau. In terms of resources, Mr. Goldstein stated his opinion that the first time the Center creates an extract file would require substantial staff resources; however after that, the process could be a set routine. No additional physical infrastructure would be needed. Dr. Kellogg noted that in addition to MLDS Center resources, MHEC would have to expend resources to address data issues. MHEC would need to convert from HEGIS code to CIP codes, which would be a significant undertaking. Mr. Dykstra agreed that the project would provide helpful information to see student outcomes beyond the state and also remarked that the

Governing Board should get a list of data fields to be shared and undertake a formal review to ensure that security standards are at least equivalent to the Center's high standards. Dr. Randall noted PSEO could provide useful return on investment information to students and their families and something that community colleges would support.

Dr. Sterett raised the concern that this project may suggest that the only value of higher education is return on investment. The value of higher education is much broader; such as citizenship, caretaking concerns, and other non-wage labor.

Dr. Shapiro noted her agreement with the benefits discussed by Secretary Rai, but also stated that she is concerned about privacy issues and keeping MLDS data for use in Maryland. She also suggested that the Board and the Center study this proposal before changing the law. Mr. Muntz questioned whether there was the potential for the Census Bureau to use Maryland data for purposes other than PSEO. Mr. Power responded that the model agreement that Census shared limits data use to the PSEO system. Further Census indicated that the agreement can be amended to add additional protections, if requested by the state. Mr. Power reiterated that he wants to change legislation so that the Board can consider participating.

Dr. Schmertz stated that she will be meeting with PSEO participants to better understand their experiences, the protections offered, and data decisions that were required for participation. She also noted that MHEC has worked hard to build trust with the institutions and as a steward of their data wants to ensure that they have ample opportunity to learn about and discuss this program. Mr. Power stated his commitment to work with all parties involved.

Mr. Goldstein noted that if MHEC is interested in this program, it is possible that they could participate directly with the U.S. Census Bureau and legislation would not be required. Dr. Rai acknowledged that was possible but stated that more time to understand the program and work with the institutions was needed. He also felt that there may be advantages to participating through the MLDS Center.

Mr. Power concluded the discussion by noting that since there were no strong objections to the program, he would work on the first step of removing the legislative hurdle. He will provide the higher education segments an opportunity to review the bill. If the legislation passes, the Board and stakeholders will then be able to consider whether and how to participate with PSEO.

Center Output

Reporting

Dr. Ann Kellogg provided an update on the progress the Center has made towards completing the 2023-2024 output priorities; noting that great strides were made in the first six months. First, Dr. Kellogg highlighted the fact that the Center provided data analysis on outcomes on justice involved youth to the Department of Juvenile Service (DJS) to support their annual report. The Center will be working to develop the results of that analysis into dashboards for the Center's website. Another highlight is the completion of the work for the Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis. The Center provided a report on the workforce outcomes for lower division degree recipients. Next, Dr. Kellogg informed the Board that the Center has nearly completed work to expand the high school to college dashboard series to include outcomes by degree, major, labor sector, and high school program completion types. Dr. Kellogg also noted that the Center has completed most of the legislatively mandated reports

that are due in December. In addition, she reported that the Center received 13 data requests, although nine of those requests were canceled because they were requesting single sector data (i.e. data from one partner agency). Finally, Dr. Kellogg noted that the Center has completed the recruitment for a new employee to work with her on reporting services.

Research

Dr. Henneberger provided highlights of the work of the Research Branch on its priorities. First, Dr. Henneberger reported that Dr. Tracy Sweet and her team at the University of Maryland have examined algorithm bias in machine learning. The team has applied analyses to K-12 assessments and will next use data science methods to study the 15 to finish higher education policy initiative. Second Dr. Henneberger reported that Dr. Terry Shaw is leading a team at the School of Social Work that is focused on a project proposal to address two of the new priorities examining the education and labor market outcomes for students involved with child welfare and the juvenile justice system. Third, Dr. Henneberger reported that the Morgan State team submitted a research proposal that focuses on understanding opportunity gaps for black students in Maryland. Dr. Frim Ampaw will define opportunity gaps using measures of participation in advanced coursework and will analyze participation among black students compared to the full student population. Opportunity gaps will be linked to outcomes, with the goal of supporting policy that helps to limit or reduce opportunity gaps. Finally, Dr. Henneberger highlighted the Research Branch's work with the AIB. The team developed and presented a framework for setting targets for outcomes that monitor Blueprint progress. The Research Branch will contribute to the AIB decision-making on the target setting process.

Dr. Henneberger also recognized the following accomplishments: (a) two graduate students received grants from AERA (American Education Research Association) for their projects using Center data; (b) Dr. Jane Lincove's manuscript entitled *A Bridge to Graduation: Secondary Effects of an Alternative Pathway for Students Who Fail Exit Exams* was published in the journal *Education Finance and Policy*; and MLDS Research Branch members gave presentations across a range of disciplines at international conferences.

Data Inventory

Ms. Molly Abend stated that there are additions to the regular data inventory from two different sources and temporary additions to the data inventory.

Student FAFSA Completion Collection System

The MLDS Center receives data from MHEC extracted from the Maryland College Aid Processing System (MDCAPS). The Board approved data elements in September. The MLDS Center was informed of additional elements for the data collection. The data elements proposed for addition include:

- | | |
|----------------------------|----------------|
| 1. Middle Name | 6. Citizenship |
| 2. Diploma Type | 7. Gender |
| 3. Driver's License Number | 8. Race |
| 4. Driver's License State | 9. Ethnicity |
| 5. County | |

Literacy, Adult, and Community Education System (LACES)

The Maryland Department of Labor and its education providers use LACES to collect and report performance data on participants of literacy programs, Adult Basic Education, and Correctional

Education. One recent addition to the LACES data collection is, “Final Grade”. This data element, when available, indicates the final grade a student received in a class.

In response to a question from Ms. Blake about digital literacy, Mr. Douglas Weimer, Supervisor of Adult Instructional Services for the Department of Labor, responded that the courses are focused on preparing adults for GED or English proficiency. Digital literacy is a required component of the courses, but there are no discreet digital literacy courses.

Board Action - Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the new data elements for inclusion in the Data Inventory, which was seconded by Mr. Dykstra. The motion was unanimously approved.

Additions to Temporary Data - Towson University - Baltimore County Public Schools - Model United Nations Program

Researchers from the Towson University have proposed adding temporary external data to the MLDS to evaluate the longitudinal outcomes for the high school participants of TU-Baltimore County Public Schools (BCPS) Model United Nations Program. This data will be brought into the MLDS, matched, and removed from the MLDS when they have completed their research. The data elements proposed for temporary addition are below. The data will be removed once the research is complete.

1. First Name
2. Last Name
3. High School
4. LEA
5. Year of Participation

In response to a question from Mr. Dykstra regarding unique identifiers, Ms. Abend responded that the research team does not have a SASID or other unique identifier of the participants. Mr. Dykstra also noted that there are numerous extracurricular programs and questioned whether the Board is creating unrealistic expectations that they all can be studied in this manner. Ms. Abend acknowledged the concern raised and noted that this program could have a benefit to the state and has been in existence for a long time. Dr. Shapiro noted that this is exactly the type of research that could address questions of civic engagement and leadership and she is therefore very supportive of the measure. Mr. Goldstein agreed that managing resources is important and that the *Project Approval and Management Procedures* gives the Center the ability to carefully review proposals and pass on them if they cannot be accommodated. Dr. Kellogg added that due to the comprehensive reporting table, the Center basically has already built a data set that we can query against; making this a relatively easy assignment.

Board Action - Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the new temporary data elements for inclusion in the Data Inventory, which was seconded by Mr. Anthony. The motion was unanimously approved.

Annual Report

Mr. Goldstein began by noting that the Annual Report is required under Education Article § 24-705, Annotated Code of Maryland. The statute specifies five sections that the Board must report on: (1) implementation and activities of the Center; (2) a list of all studies performed; (3) a list of data determined to be unnecessary; (4) proposed or planned expansion of data; and (5) recommendations of the Board. Mr. Goldstein provided highlights from each of the sections of the report.

Section 1 - Implementation Activities of the Center. This section is in two parts. The first part is on system implementation and management and includes a records count, match rate, information about a recent security audit, and information on a new quality improvement application that was developed and used by staff. The second part reports on activities of the Center, including:

1. Engagement with state policy makers such as the Center's work with the Accountability and Implementation Board (AIB) and the Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis;
2. A listing of all data requests;
3. Support for State agencies' reporting requirements;
4. Research Series conducted during the year;
5. Conferences and presentations provided by staff and researchers;
6. An overview of the Research Agenda revisions;
7. The publication of four research papers in prestigious academic journals;
8. A list of grant funding sought;
9. Providing consultation for five states on longitudinal data system governance;
10. The Center's ongoing partnership with Morgan State; and
11. The Center's participation with the new Service Year Option/Maryland Corp program.

Section 2 - List of all studies performed - This section includes a list of research conducted, dashboards created or enhanced, and reports completed.

Section 3 - Data Determined to be Unnecessary - This section lists the three data elements that were removed from the MLDS this year.

Section 4 - Planned Expansion of Data - This section lists all new data added to the system, which included 140 new data elements and 77 external, temporary data elements added to the system.

Section 5 - Recommendations of the Governing Board. Mr. Goldstein noted that there were no suggested recommendations from the Center or the Research and Policy Advisory Board. Dr. Shapiro complimented the wonderful work of the Center and asked whether Mr. Goldstein had any recommendations for the Board that would be helpful to the Center. Mr. Goldstein thanked Dr. Shapiro and stated that he had no recommendations to put forward at this time.

Board Action - Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the Annual Report, which was seconded by Mr. Dykstra. The motion was unanimously approved.

December Report Highlights

Dr. Kellogg provided highlights from the reports that are required to be submitted to the Governor and General Assembly in December. Dr. Kellogg noted that the Center is no longer required to create a Dual Enrollment Report. Instead, the Center must maintain and update dashboards with the required reporting content.

Next, Dr. Kellogg addressed the Student FAFSA (Free Application for Federal Student Aid) Completion Report. The Center is unable to complete this report as intended in the legislation. Dr. Kellogg spent a lot of time working with the MDCAPS system to figure out the best way to extract the data from the system. However, due to the transactional nature of that database, there is no way to report on completion by a specific date (which was an essential component of the report). Even though the report could not be completed using MLDS data from MDCAPS, the reporting requirements can be mostly fulfilled by using the US Department of Education data on this subject. The data is reported in stages which enables reporting on FAFSA completion by certain dates: February 28th, which corresponds to the deadline for

state financial aid; and August 30th, which would be closest to the start of fall semester. MLDS Center will work with MHEC to make sure the new MDCAPS system can provide data consistent with the Center's reporting requirements.

In response to Dr. Shapiro regarding Dual Enrollment reporting as it relates to the Blueprint, Dr. Kellogg responded that there have been no special requests from the AIB to modify the dashboards or add additional content to the existing dashboards. Mr. Perkins-Cohen commented on various boards and committees that are interested in MLDS data to understand: the outcomes for apprenticeship program participants; the number of CTE completers with industry credentials; and correctional education outcomes.

Next Dr. Kellogg provided a brief overview of findings from the Career Preparation Expansion Act Report; Foster Care and Higher Education Participation; and Youth Experiencing Homelessness and Higher Education Participation Reports. Finally, Dr. Kellogg also discussed the dual enrollment dashboard which shows a small decrease in the percentage of students who dually enroll.

Projects Applications and Updates

Mr. Goldstein stated that two new projects that he approved pursuant to the *Project Approval and Management Procedures*. The first project, *Consequences of Multidimensional Grade Variation for Students*, was proposed by Dr. Nolan Pope, University of Maryland, Department of Economics. Dr. Pope plans to study how variations in grading affect student learning, high school graduation, transition to college, and later career success. In other words, he is trying to understand the effects that increasing (or decreasing) grades has on students' long-run outcomes. The project was approved because:

1. There were not objections to the project during the internal staff review and the review by the Research and Policy Advisory Board;
2. The subject is responsive to the Research agenda;
3. The project provides information about student performance that can be used to improve education delivery;
4. The project clearly requires the use of longitudinal data; and
5. The project is being conducted by a highly qualified researcher.

The second approved project, which was discussed earlier in the meeting, is on the *Longitudinal Outcomes for Maryland Public Schools - Towson University Model United Nations Participants*. The project will be done by Dr. Kellogg and Dr. Alison McCartney who is a Professor at Towson University and runs the Model UN program. The project seeks to understand the long term outcomes for students participating in the Model UN at Towson. The project will utilize the existing MLDS Center high school college dashboard series to provide data tables for Model UN participants. The project was approved because:

1. There were not objections to the project during the internal staff review and the review by the Research and Policy Advisory Board;
2. The subject is responsive to the Research agenda;
3. The project provides information about student performance that can be used to improve education delivery;
4. The project clearly requires the use of longitudinal data; and
5. The project is being conducted by a highly qualified researcher.

Next, Dr. Henneberger clarified that her IES grant project (Long-Term Effects of PBIS Plus: A Randomized Controlled Trial in Maryland Public Elementary Schools), the application for a grant to IES (Using Maryland's SLDS to Strengthen and Diversify the Teacher Workforce Through High School to Career Pathways Dr. Jane Lincove, UMBC School of Public Policy), and Dr. Nolan Pope's project are all Research Branch projects.

Mid-Year Budget Report

Mr. Goldstein noted that the Board reviewed and approved the Center's FY 24 annual budget during the June 2023 meeting. The Center's general fund budget is on target for the year. There are two new revenue sources that have been added to the Center's budget this year. First, the Center entered into an interagency agreement with the Accountability and Implementation Board (AIB). The agreement states that the MLDS Center will provide research services to support the AIB. Specifically, the Center is required to assign a Research Branch member to serve as the lead researcher and liaison to the AIB. The researcher will be responsible for leading research efforts specified in the Scope of Work; serving as the primary point of contact for the AIB; and participating in meetings and projects as requested by AIB. Under the agreement, AIB will fund the work performed by the Center up to \$203,000 for the current fiscal year.

The second revenue change is due to the Center's participation with the Service Year Option/Maryland Corps program. The MLDS Center is hosting two Maryland Corps members. Maryland Corps is an opportunity for people of all ages (compared to the Service Year Option which is only for 18-21 year olds) interested in performing public and community service in Maryland. Members must be paid a minimum of \$15 dollars an hour for 30 hours per week. The Department of Service and Civic Innovation (DSCI) issued grants to participating employers to offset the cost of the salaries. The MLDS Center received a grant for \$55,440 which will fully cover the required salaries.

Old Business

There was no new business.

Closing

Dr. Shapiro made a motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Mr. Dykstra. The motion was unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,
Ross Goldstein
Executive Director

Approved: March 8, 2024