



**Maryland Longitudinal Data System Governing Board  
Meeting Minutes for March 11, 2022**

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on March 11, 2022, via conference call. Dr. Fielder, Chairman of the Governing Board was absent, so Mr. Abed, Vice-Chair of the Governing Board, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

**The following Governing Board members were in attendance:**

- Mr. Sam Abed, Secretary, Department of Juvenile Services (John Irvine, Director of Research and Evaluation served as designee for part of the meeting)
- Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach (Designee for Dr. Jay Perman, Chancellor)
- Mr. Gregory James, Deputy Secretary for Operations, Department of Human Services (Designee for Secretary Padilla)
- Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice President for Academic Affairs, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association (Designee for Ms. Sara Fidler, President)
- Dr. Monica Randall, Deputy Director, Maryland Association of Community Colleges (Designee for Dr. Brad Phillips, Executive Director)
- Mr. Jason Dykstra, Executive Director, Instructional Data Division, Anne Arundel County Public Schools
- Dr. Susan Sterett, Professor, University of Maryland, Baltimore County
- Dr. Phyllis Keys, Acting Interim Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs and Professor of Finance, Morgan State University (Designee for President Wilson)
- Mr. Maurice Good, Program Director, Maryland New Directions
- Mr. Chris Biggs, Information Assurance Manager, Raytheon Company
- Ms. Laurie Kendall-Ellis, Executive Director of the Maryland Board of Physical Therapy Examiners
- Mr. Steven Rizzi, Vice President, PAR Government

**The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:**

- Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
- Ms. Tejal Cherry, Director of System Management Branch, MLDS Center
- Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
- Dr. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center, and MHEC Liaison
- Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator, MLDS Center, and MSDE Liaison
- Ms. Dawn Luedtke, Assistant Attorney General
- Mr. Roy Enehiroana, Data Analyst, MLDS Center, and Department of Labor Liaison
- Ms. Jamese Dixon-Bobbitt, Executive Associate, MLDS Center

### **Approval of the December 10, 2021, Meeting Minutes**

Mr. Abed asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the December 10, 2021 meeting. Mr. Dykstra made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Ms. Kendall-Ellis. The motion was unanimously approved.

### **Center Output**

#### Reporting Service

Dr. Kellogg reported on the progress made on 2021-2022 Output Priorities. The Center is preparing for two new reporting requirements: one on the postsecondary outcomes of students who experienced out-of-home placement, and one on financial aid outreach. The Center also completed updating and refreshing the high school to college series of dashboards. Disaggregation by race and ethnicity were added and the dashboards were updated. The series now contains 78 dashboards. Dr. Kellogg also noted that the Center is working to gather data for two new reporting requirements on financial aid outreach and on the postsecondary outcomes of certain child welfare recipients. In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro, Dr. Kellogg explained that the dashboards are updated every year, but that the Center's data lagged by a year, which is intentional since time is needed for cross-sector analysis.

Next, Dr. Kellogg turned to discuss supplemental reporting on the Career Preparation Expansion Act (CPEA) Report. The 2021 CPEA Report analyzed the five-year post-high school workforce outcomes of the 2015 cohort of high school graduates. Five years for this cohort corresponds to the beginning of the COVID shutdowns. The first supplement reports on differences in outcomes for this cohort as compared to prior cohorts. The supplement contains the following findings:

1. All groups were impacted by the shutdown, but not uniformly. For example, wages for males declined by \$90 compared to the prior year's cohort. Female wages saw a much greater decline (\$662).
2. The differences also resulted in greater wage gaps between males and females and between White high school graduates compared to African American, Hispanic, and Asian high school graduates.
3. There were also variations in wages based on educational attainment. For the most part, all educational attainment groups had a negative impact, except bachelor's degree recipients who surprisingly had higher median quarterly wages.

Finally, Dr. Kellogg noted that other supplements are planned for later in the year, including an analysis of impacts by labor sectors.

#### Research Branch

Dr. Henneberger began by reviewing the Research Branch's four main priorities:

1. In collaboration with MLDS Center stakeholders and with a commitment to social justice and equity, conduct advanced statistical analyses to inform decision-making in Maryland in order to optimize public education and workforce systems that serve Maryland children, youth, adults, and families.
2. Build capacity to conduct rigorous research through providing technical and methodological documentation.
3. Establish and maintain diverse and inclusive research partnerships by promoting equitable access to data and resources.

4. Support the above goals through the pursuit of additional funding opportunities.

Next, Dr. Henneberger referred to projects that correspond to the four main priorities. For the first priority, Dr. Henneberger highlighted work that she and Dr. Bess Rose are doing to answer the question, “what are the outcomes for students with prior DJS involvement?” The first step of this project was to determine what constitutes DJS involvement and then to create a cohort of ninth-grade students who had any DJS involvement defined as any complaint, probation, or commitment. In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi, Dr. Henneberger confirmed that DJS involvement is binary; any complaint, probation, or commitment resulted in inclusion in the cohort. Dr. Henneberger commented that a more nuanced approach may be developed as work continues. The next step of the project was to examine 4-year and 6-year high school completion, 2-year and 4-year college enrollments, workforce visibility, wages, and industry. A question that arises is, what would those outcomes have looked like if the students had not experienced DJS involvement? The research could simply compare their outcomes to students without prior DJS involvement. However, DJS-involved students look very different from non-DJS involved students on a multitude of characteristics, not just their DJS involvement. This points to the need to develop a rigorous comparison group, such as demographically similar students without DJS involvement and/or students with long-term absences for other reasons. Mr. Abed noted his enthusiasm for this work as it will provide outcomes measures beyond recidivism. He also noted that analysis on the type of DJS involvement is an important aspect in understanding outcomes.

Before moving on to the Data Inventory agenda item, Mr. Goldstein introduced new members of the Board: Dr. Monica Randall, Deputy Director of the Maryland Association of Community Colleges, who is serving as the designee for Dr. Brad Phillips; Dr. Phyllis Keys, Acting Interim Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs and Professor of Finance at Morgan State University, who is serving as the new designee (replacing Dr. Moazzami) for Dr. David Wilson, President; and Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice President for Academic Affairs for the Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association, who is serving as the designee for Ms. Sara Fidler, President.

### **Data Inventory**

Ms. Molly Abend began by noting that there are 61 new proposed data elements for consideration from three data sources, two of which are new data sources.

First, the Department of Juvenile Services Juvenile is providing data that will aid in identifying whether a youth had an interaction with DJS prior to the start of MLDS data in 2008. The data elements proposed for inclusion in the Data Inventory include first complaint data, first probation disposition date, and first commitment disposition date.

Second, the Social Services Administration within the Department of Human Services will provide data in response to legislation passed during the 2021 Legislative Session, which changed the definition of student data to include child welfare data. Specifically, that legislation defined child welfare data to include data relating to a child’s experience with the child protective services, family preservation services, and state-sponsored out-of-home services. The MLDS Center is phasing in the child welfare data, beginning with out-of-home services data. These data were selected first because the MLDS Center has a reporting requirement to fulfill this year on the experience of former children in out-of-home placements and how out-of-home placement affected participation in higher education. Half of the data

(21 data elements) are demographic characteristics and the rest (19 data elements) relate to out-of-home services. Ms. Abend noted that the full list of elements are included in the meeting materials.

The final set of data elements are Microsoft certification. This is a new domain of data from resources that define a competency or qualification, achievement, personal or organizational quality, experience, attribute, or aspect of an identity typically used to indicate suitability. The first credentials data to be included in the MLDS will be from Microsoft/Certiport. Certiport is the testing service Microsoft uses to administer its certification testing. The Microsoft certification data contains Microsoft certification testing results of Maryland students. Certiport is the service used by Microsoft to provide its industry certification testing. The data elements include eight demographic data elements and ten elements related to the credentials.

In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi, Ms. Abend clarified that the DJS data indicator of prior involvement will go back to 1993. Next, Mr. Dykstra asked about the DJS complaints and whether they are all from law enforcement. Mr. Abend responded that the vast majority (85%) are from law enforcement, but there are other complaint sources, such as school complaints. Mr. Dykstra, noted that false complaints or complaints that do not go anywhere would cause this data to be less useful. Mr. Abend also noted that the data has some research value and may provide insights on risk factors. Mr. James asked if the system screens out complaints that do not go anywhere. Mr. Abend responded that intake workers can use diversion and not forward cases to the State's Attorney, but this does not necessarily address if the complaint wasn't properly brought. Ms. Luedtke clarified that the school-to-prison pipeline inquiries are interested in understanding the impact of all interactions with the criminal justice system. It would be good to have this information and break it out into diversion, referral, or prosecution - all distinguishable and part of the initial contact with the system. Ms. Abend noted that the data dictionary could include a notation cautioning that the data may include complaints that don't wind up in convictions.

**Board Action:** Mr. Biggs made a motion to approve the proposed data elements for inclusion in the data inventory, which was seconded by Dr. Sterett. The motion was unanimously approved.

## **2022 Legislation Session**

Mr. Goldstein provided an overview of legislation that directly or indirectly impacts the MLDS Center. First, HB 132/SB 498 - *Student Horizon Database and Scorecard* requires annual collection of and reporting on: the cost of attendance for colleges and private career schools; student loan information, and graduation and completion rates; completion rate and starting salary of students in apprenticeship and CTE programs; salaries of students who enlist in the military; and the number of college graduates working in occupations that do not require a college degree. Both the House and Senate bills have been withdrawn by the sponsor.

Second, HB 127 and SB 277 - *Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center - Division of Correction - Data*, requires the Division of Correction in the Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services (DPSCS), to exchange with the Center: records and pertinent information that relates to current or former inmates. The bill authorizes the Center to collect Correctional Services data, which is defined as arrest and incarceration data. The bill also requires reporting on participation in a prison-based education or training program, participation in a work-release program, and rates of recidivism. Finally, the bill adds the Secretary of DPSCS to the Board. The bills are not moving. DPSCS has raised a number of concerns,

including that they are legally prohibited from sharing the data as contemplated by the legislation. However, while DPSCS did not want a requirement to share data, they are willing to enter into a data-sharing agreement with the Center. At this point, the bill sponsors are considering only pursuing a change that would remove the restriction against the inclusion of criminal history data in the MLDS.

Finally, SB 440 - HB 625 establishes the *Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis in Maryland*. These bills do not specifically name the MLDS Center. However, many of the topics the Commission is directed to study will be aided by the data-sharing partnerships being established between the MLDS Center and the health occupation boards and commissions. For example, one provision requires the Commission to examine turnover rates and average rate of tenure. The Center can also contribute information to questions concerning the state educational institutions and how effectively they are feeding the health occupations. The Senate bill passed out of that chamber and is over in the House. Mr. Goldstein noted that Ms. Kendall-Ellis sent an email noting that, as amended, the bill names the following health occupations as the focus of the Commission: Professional Counselors and Therapists, Nursing, Pharmacy, and Physicians. This information will help the Center prioritize which commissions to gather data from first.

Dr. Shapiro asked whether the fiscal note for the health care study commission legislation includes a fiscal impact statement on the cost to the Center for providing needed research and analysis. Mr. Goldstein responded that it does not, but noted that the fiscal notes do not lead to funding. Dr. Shapiro stressed the importance of additional funding to support the expansion of the Center's portfolio.

### **Research Agenda Review**

Mr. Goldstein began by explaining that this agenda item is to provide an overview of the process staff are undertaking to review the Research Agenda. At the December meeting, the Governing Board added a recommendation to the Annual Report for staff to undertake a review of the research agenda. As noted in the recommendation, the agenda has remained substantially the same for over 10 years. There have been minor changes, but no comprehensive review. Accordingly, the directive in the Annual report was to examine the following questions

1. What purpose should the Research Agenda serve?
2. Are the current questions sufficient to address the Center's added scope of work as a result of legislative changes and new data sources?
3. How can the agenda address questions of social equity?

Dr. Kellogg continued by noting that the process of reviewing the Research Agenda began in February with the Research and Policy Advisory Board (RPB). There were productive conversations with RPB about the role of the Research Agenda, its relationship to the data; its relationship to the research undertaken by the Center. The RPB also reviewed three research agendas from different states: Virginia; Washington; and Connecticut; which differed in their scope, specificity, and approach to issues of social justice and special populations. The April RPB meeting will include two individuals who took part in the drafting of the current Research Agenda in order to understand what was considered at that time and what the drafters wanted to achieve. Staff will then use May through July to rethink and reshape an agenda which will be presented to RPB in August. Staff will update the Board in September and plans to have a final product for consideration in December.

### **External Research and Grant Funded Projects**

Dr. Henneberger updated the Board on two external research projects that will be completed in 2022. First, the Baltimore Education Research Consortium (BERC) is refreshing its 2018, *Launching into Adulthood* study. That study was completed as a collaboration between BERC, the Center, and Baltimore's Promise. The goals of the project were to document the post-high school graduation destinations of several consecutive Baltimore City Public Schools graduating cohorts, chart the 6-year pathways of the oldest available cohort (class of 2009), and examine variations in outcomes by student characteristics. BERC will leverage the prior code and analyses to complete an updated report that uses additional cohorts of students and examines additional comparisons, including gender, race/ethnicity, and local school system. The second external project is by researchers at the Maryland Assessment Research Center (MARC). MARC is partnering with MSDE to begin a study requested by MSDE to explore the relationship between: (1) high school state and national standardized tests, and other predictors of achievement measured in high school; and (2) actual success in postsecondary coursework and/or workforce outcomes. In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro, Dr. Henneberger confirmed that the study is being done to support the Blueprint requirement for a 10th-grade college and career readiness standard.

### **Morgan University Research Partnership**

Dr. Henneberger updated the Board on progress made towards establishing Morgan State University as part of the Center's Research Branch. To date, the partnership has identified faculty partners at Morgan State, which will include Dr. Omari Jackson and Dr. Rhonda Baylor, both from the School of Education and Urban Studies. Morgan is working on preparing a budget and submitting Institutional Review Board documentation. Finally, Drs. Jackson and Baylor are planning to provide presentations of their current research for the Research Branch's next *Research Series*.

### **Review of Bylaws**

Mr. Goldstein noted that the Governing Board reviews the bylaws at the first (March) meeting of the year. There is the standard business with the rotation of the Vice-Chair and other edits and proposals. The most significant proposed change is the addition of Article 7 regarding the Organizational Placement and Location of the Center. State law, in two locations, Education Article, §§ 24-702(c) and 24-704(g)(1), requires the Board to establish the organizational placement and location of the Center. The purpose of this new provision is to codify the decisions that were made by the Board. The fact that we are putting this in writing, does not mean these decisions cannot be changed. The Board has the authority to update bylaws at any time.

The organizational structure decisions include: (1) locating the Center's headquarters at the University of Maryland, Baltimore (UMB); (2) selecting UMB to serve as the Center's Research Branch and providing funding for a Research Branch Director, a statistician, and faculty and staff from MD public colleges and universities to perform projects; (3) the establishment of liaison positions with the original partner agencies; and (4) establishing a facility for data center hosting.

Finally, Mr. Goldstein noted that in addition to having formal documentation of the prior decisions made, the inclusion of this Article in the bylaws will help justify continued sole source agreements with UMB and will acknowledge UMB's ongoing commitment to the MLDS Center.

In response to a question from Mr. James, Mr. Goldstein clarified that the Governing Board had reviewed and approved the decision to relocate the system to the Department of Information Technology's data enterprise center. The discussions and decisions occurred prior to DHS being part of the Governing Board.

Next, Mr. Goldstein reviewed other proposed edits and changes to the bylaws:

- a. §2.3A(6) - adds the Secretary of Human Services to the Vice-Chair rotation schedule;
- b. §2.3C - moves the rotation schedule from §5.7 to be included under the Vice-Chair section of the bylaws;
- c. §5.1 - removes the requirement to "develop an implementation plan to phase in the establishment and operation of the system and the Center," since this task has been accomplished;
- d. §5.2H - removes this provision since it is redundant of 5.2F; and
- e. §5.3 - adds the CIO for DHS to the Cybersecurity Subcommittee.

Mr. Goldstein stated that, according to the rotation schedule, Superintendent Choudhury will be the new Vice-Chair. Mr. Abed expressed his concern of appointing Mr. Choudhury without his being at the meeting or aware of the appointment. Ms. Luedtke suggested amending the bylaws to allow the scheduled vice-chair to have the option to decline the role, in which case the current vice-chair will remain in the position. Mr. James thought Ms. Luedtke's proposal could result in the current vice-chair being stuck in the position. Mr. James suggested that the current model ensures engagement and shared responsibility. Ms. Luedtke proposed that if the scheduled vice-chair is unable to serve, the Board could select the vice-chair from its members.

**Board Action** - Mr. Abed made a motion to table the by-laws until the next meeting when Mr. Choudhury has a chance to be informed and determine if there are any issues. Mr. James seconded the motion which was unanimously approved.

### **Old Business**

There was no old business.

### **New Business**

There was no new business.

### **Closing**

Dr. Sterett made a motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Mr. Biggs. The motion was unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,  
Ross Goldstein  
Executive Director

**Approved:** June 10, 2022