



Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center Governing Board Meeting Minutes for March 8, 2024

DRAFT

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on March 8, 2024, via teleconference. Newly appointed Governing Board Chair, Secretary Portia Wu, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

The following Governing Board members were in attendance:

Ms. Portia Wu, Secretary, Maryland Department of Labor and Chair
Dr. Barbara Schmertz, Director of Research and Policy Analysis, Maryland Higher Education Commission (Designee for Secretary Rai)
Ms. Chandra Haislet, Assistant State Superintendent, Division of Assessment, Accountability, and Performance Reporting, Maryland State Department of Education (Designee for Interim State Superintendent Wright)
Dr. Sharmin Hossain, Chief Data Officer, Department of Human Services (Designee for Secretary Rafael López)
Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach, University System of Maryland (Designee for Dr. Jay Perman, Chancellor)
Mr. Matt Power, President, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association and Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice-President (Designee for President Power)
Dr. Brad Phillips, Executive Director, Maryland Association of Community Colleges
Dr. Phyllis Keys, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs, Morgan State University (Designee for President Wilson)
Mr. Jason Dykstra, Chief Accountability Officer, Instructional Data Division, Anne Arundel County Public Schools
Ms. Laurie Kendall-Ellis, Executive Director, State Board of Physical Therapy Examiners
Ms. Hussainatu Blake, Education and Workforce Strategist, Patrick J. McGovern Foundation
Dr. Susan Sterett, Professor of Public Policy, University of Maryland, Baltimore County

The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:

Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
Dr. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center, and MHEC Liaison
Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator, MLDS Center, and MSDE Liaison
Mr. Roy Enehiroana, Data Analyst, MLDS Center, and Labor Liaison
Ms. Jeaneen Johnson, Assistant Attorney General

Approval of the Meeting Minutes

Ms. Wu asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the December 8, 2023 meeting. Mr. Dykstra made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Dr. Shapiro. The motion was unanimously approved.

Bylaws

Mr. Goldstein noted that §1.3C of the *Bylaws of the MLDS Governing Board*, requires the members of the Board to review the Bylaws on an annual basis at the first regularly scheduled meeting of the calendar year, which is the current meeting. Mr. Goldstein stated that he did not have any proposed changes or updates to the Bylaws. Mr. Goldstein also noted that, pursuant to the Bylaw's rotating schedule, the Vice-Chair of the Board is Department of Human Services Secretary Raphael Lopez. Mr. Goldstein asked if the Board members had any suggested changes or updates to the bylaws. No comments or updates were discussed.

Center Output

Reporting

Dr. Ann Kellogg provided updates on the Center's reporting services work for the current production year (July 1, 2023 through June 30, 2024). Dr. Kellogg stated that six of the Center's required reports have been completed and submitted, including two new reports on participation in higher education for youth in foster care and youth experiencing homelessness. Those reports will be developed into dashboards in the future. The Center also completed eight of the required 22 data tables produced each year to support the work of other state agencies and various stakeholders, including a number of colleges that rely on MLDS data to drive accreditation reports and regulatory requirements. The rest of the data tables are on track to be completed on time. Dr. Kellogg pointed out that some of the data tables are quite expansive, including a major analysis for the *Commission to Study the Healthcare Workforce Crisis*. That analysis provided an in-depth study of the outcomes of community college graduates and their healthcare-related majors and their participation in the healthcare labor market in Maryland. In addition, the Center created data tables for all 16 community colleges on performance accountability metrics. The tables focus not only on pre and post earnings outcomes for community college graduates, but also include results disaggregated by Major. The Center also expanded the *Maryland Public High School Graduates: College and Workforce Outcomes* dashboards series. That series offers approximately 70 different combinations of data disaggregations. New disaggregations include college major and labor market sector. Expanded enrollment patterns were also added to include students who enroll one year and two years post high school graduation. Dr. Kellogg also reported that the Center completed its first analysis for the Department of Juvenile Services and an analysis on labor market outcomes for incarcerated individuals who complete a correctional education program. Dr. Kellogg also reported that output for the Workforce Data Quality Initiative grant is behind schedule due to delays in receiving data and that work for the Governor's Workforce Development Board on career and technical education (CTE) and youth apprenticeship are still in the planning stages. Finally, Dr. Kellogg noted that in January, the Center hired a new research statistician, Alex Handler, who is reporting to Dr. Kellogg and will increase the productivity of the Reporting Services Branch.

Dr. Phillips commented on the incredible amount of output and the rich information it provides to stakeholders. He also requested a briefing for the community college presidents. Dr. Kellogg stated that she is happy to attend their meeting and provide an overview of relevant Center output. Ms. Wu also

noted that presentations to sister agencies on Center output would also be valuable to raise awareness of the work of the Center.

Research Branch

Dr. Henneberger began by noting that the Research Branch has two main priorities: (1) conduct in-depth statistical analyses to support causal inference and inform policy; and (2) methodological documentation. Under the first priority is research on pathways from high school to college and the workforce; and under the second priority there is research focused on intersectionality in characteristics predicting outcomes. The Research Branch is addressing those topics through its partnership with Dr. Frim Ampaw who is leading a Morgan State team in submitting a research proposal that focuses on understanding opportunity gaps for black students in Maryland. Dr. Ampaw will define opportunity gaps using measures of access to and participation in advanced coursework, with a specific focus on access and uptake for black students. Opportunity gaps will be linked to college and workforce outcomes with the goal of informing decisions for closing opportunity gaps across the state. This project is currently moving through the project approval process, so the Board will hear more about the project in the coming meetings. Dr. Henneberger also highlighted a new partnership between the Research Branch and the University of Baltimore; faculty member Dr. Dawnsha Mushonga is studying black student pathways from high school into college and focusing on the institutional characteristics that support black student degree attainment once enrolled in college. Next, Dr. Henneberger highlighted the continued research on diversifying the teacher pipeline. A team of researchers, led by Dr. Jane Lincove at UMBC, submitted a one million dollar federal grant application to the Institute of Education Sciences. Dr. Henneberger, the Maryland Higher Education Commission, and researchers at the University of Maryland, College Park are all key partners in that effort. The team has received positive news, but cannot make any official announcements at this time. Dr. Henneberger noted that the Research Series on May 17th at noon will feature Dr. David Blazer's work on expanding and diversifying the teacher pipeline in Maryland. Dr. Henneberger also reported that the research team at the School of Social Work is working on a project proposal to address one of the research topics under the first priority: examining the education and labor market outcomes for students who are cross involved with out-of-home placement and the juvenile justice system. In addition, Dr. Henneberger noted that the Research Branch is supporting the Accountability and Implementation Board (AIB) Outcomes Measures Work Group. Research Branch members have been participating in meetings with data stewards at MSDE and MHEC on the receipt of aggregate data files to support AIB decision making. The Research Branch has also provided draft charts for setting targets for key outcome metrics that were defined by the AIB Outcomes Measures Work Group.

The second major priority is developing methodological documentation. Dr. Henneberger highlighted a project on data science and equity being conducted by Dr. Tracy Sweet at the University of Maryland, College Park. Dr. Sweet's team is examining the application of machine learning algorithms to cross sector longitudinal data, with a focus on examining machine learning biases when applying those algorithms. These analyses were applied within the context of assessments predicting college enrollment, which is a key topic for equity concerns. The next step, in partnership with MHEC, is to apply data science methods to look at college credit attainment. Finally Dr. Henneberger noted that Research Branch members are giving presentations at national and international conferences across a range of disciplines.

In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro about supporting the AIB, Mr. Goldstein responded that the MLDS Center and the AIB entered into an intergovernmental agreement to provide funding to pay for the work being conducted by the Research Branch on behalf of the AIB.

2024 Legislative Session

Mr. Goldstein noted that during the current legislative session, the following bills have an impact on or are of interest to the MLDS Center.

1. SB 444 / HB 634 - *Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center - Student Information - United States Census Bureau*. This bill allows the MLDS Center Governing Board to authorize the Center to send student information to the United States Census Bureau. As discussed during the December Governing Board meeting, the purpose of sharing data with Census is to participate with their Post-Secondary Employment Outcomes (PSEO) explorer project. Both bills passed their respective chambers and are working through the opposite chamber. In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro, Mr. Goldstein confirmed that the bill permits, but does not require, the Governing Board to participate with PSEO. In response to a question from Dr. Phillips, Mr. Goldstein stated that neither the bill nor a decision by the Governing Board would require a college to participate with PSEO. Mr. Goldstein added that the bill would not prohibit a college from participating with the PSEO, noting that a college could currently provide its data to the Census Bureau for inclusion with PSEO. Mr. Power clarified that PSEO prefers to work with an entire segment in a state, rather than just a few institutions in a state.
2. SB 756 - *Primary and Secondary Education - School Safety and Student Well-Being - Examination of Policies and Funding*. This bill requires the Maryland Center for School Safety (MCSS), Maryland State Department of Education (MSDE), and the Interagency Commission On School Construction to review and develop guidelines on the state of physical security in schools and establish school safety funding requirements. The bill also requires MSDE, in consultation with MCSS and the MLDS Center, to provide an analysis of the effect State and local policies had on school safety and student well-being. A committee hearing was held, but there has been no further action.
3. SB 818 / HB 1271 - *Information Technology - Artificial Intelligence - Policies and Procedures (Artificial Intelligence Governance Act of 2024)*. This bill requires all units of state government to create and submit to the Chief Data Officer, an inventory of data collected. The bill provides a definition of artificial intelligence and requires each unit of state government to conduct an inventory of systems that employ artificial intelligence. Finally, the bill establishes the Governor's Artificial Intelligence Subcabinet. Committee hearings were held in both chambers, but no further action has been taken.
4. SB 1017 - *Correctional Services - Maryland Correctional Enterprises - Formerly Incarcerated Individuals*. This bill requires the Maryland Correctional Enterprises (MCE) to connect incarcerated individuals with job opportunities before parole. The programs established by MCE must include a plan for employment within 60 days of release. The MLDS Center among other agencies are required to provide consultation on the programs. A committee hearing was held but no further action has been taken.
5. SB 1022/ HB 1244 - *Maryland Higher Education Commission - Academic Program Approval and Institutional Mission Statements - Requirements*. This bill requires the Department of Labor, Department of Commerce and the Higher Education Commission (MHEC) to each have one

full-time staff member to work collaboratively with one another in producing uniform and consistent baseline data about workforce needs to inform State policies relating to postsecondary education (including the State Plan for Higher Education and program approvals). The bill specifies that MHEC is required to consult with other state agencies with expertise in specific workforce segments, including the MLDS Center. Committee hearings recently held in both chambers. Dr. Shapiro asked whether the bill requires MLDS Center staff to work on the required reporting and analysis or if the agencies that have to assign a full time staff will provide the needed resources. Mr. Goldstein responded that it seemed like a good approach to have the agencies (Labor and MHEC) assign someone to work directly with the MLDS Center data. Mr. Goldstein noted that he will update the fiscal estimate to include more resources for the Center to meet the requirements of the bill. Mr. Power noted that he served on a task force that established the recommendations that led to this bill. The goal of the bill is to establish an independent and objective way of determining workforce needs and have those needs inform decisions about new program approvals.

6. SB 620 / HB 92 - *Resources and Education for All Prisons (REAP) Act*. This bill requires the Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services (DPSCS) to assist incarcerated individuals in accessing federal Pell Grants for higher education. The bill also requires the Department of Labor to set goals for the number of incarcerated individuals in education programs, establish a tracking system, and forward information from the tracking system to the Maryland Higher Education system. HB 92 passed third reading in the House and was heard in committee in the Senate.

Finally, Mr. Goldstein reported on the Center's FY 25 budget, which is currently under consideration in the General Assembly. The Governor's budget allocated \$3,526,666 for the MLDS Center for FY 25. The budget analysis by the Department of Legislative Services contained no proposed cuts and did not have any questions or issues for the Center. The allocation represents a minor reduction of \$5,181 from the FY 24 allocation.

Regulation Review

Mr. Goldstein began by noting that in accordance with State Government Article, §§10-130—10-139, Annotated Code of Maryland, each State agency that adopts regulations must review those regulations every eight years. The purpose of the review is to determine whether the regulations are necessary for the public interest, continue to be supported by statutory authority and judicial opinion, or are appropriate for amendment or repeal.

Mr. Goldstein noted that there are six chapters that make up the MLDS Center's Regulations and that he along with Ms. Abend and Ms. Johnson, AAG and counsel to the MLDS Center, reviewed all the chapters. In all chapters there are updates to statutory citations where necessary and revisions for clarity.

Next, Mr. Goldstein provided a summary of the specific proposed changes.

1. Chapter 14.36.01 - Inspection and copying of public records
 - In Regulation 01 - Adds a clarification that this Chapter on inspection and copying of records does not apply to data requests. Chapter 04 covers those requests.
 - Regulation 02 - Adds that the Center's policy is to make all public records accessible on the website

- Regulation 03 - Adds a new definition of “data partner” referring to all of the sources that provide data to the Center. In the definition of the “Center,” the term "councils" is replaced by "boards" since the Center has advisory boards, not councils.
- Regulation 09 - Uses the newly defined “data partner” term to refer to the entities that provide data to the Center. Removes *Data Safeguarding and Security Plan* (DSSP) from the list of documents available for immediate inspection. The DSSP contains security information that should not be disclosed.
- Regulation 11 - Removes the provision regarding a record being “in the custody and control of the person to whom the application is made.” The MLDS Center is a small agency and records and requests are all centrally managed, so there is no need for this distinction.
- Regulation 15 - Removes the reference in section A to "copying and certifying copies" of records since it is repeated in (3) in the same section.
- Regulation 15 - Adds a provision that clarifies that there is no charge for electronic records provided in an electronic format.
- Regulation 16 - Adds a requirement that applicants who want to inspect records in person must have an appointment. This is necessary since the MLDS Center staff are remote.
- The term “custodian” is used instead of the "executive director" throughout.
- 2. Chapter 14.36.02 - Corrections of Public Records
 - References to the Center were changed to the Custodian.
 - Regulation 09 - Amended for clarity and to add that requests can be submitted electronically.
- 3. Chapter 14.36.03 - Meetings
 - Regulation 01 - The definition of "Center" is amended to only mean the Center and not the Governing Board, committees, etc. The additional designations are not necessary and would result in RPB and Data GAB having to be open meetings.
 - Throughout, references to the Center are replaced with references to the Governing Board since the Governing Board is the public body.
 - In Regulation 02 - Section C is moved to Regulation 03.
- 4. 14.36.04 - Data Requests
 - This Chapter is renamed “Data Requests,” instead of “Longitudinal Data Requests.” The term longitudinal is not needed and does not clarify the type of data that can be requested. Instead, a definition of “data request” is added in Regulation 02 to clarify the type of data that can be requested.
 - Regulation 02 - Adds two new definitions. First, "data partner" is defined to include all of the sources that provide data to the Center. Second, "data request" is defined and makes a distinction between what constitutes a data request and distinguishes data requests from research requests.
 - Regulation 03 - Limits the required information collected for a data request. The regulation included information that is more appropriate for a project request.
 - Regulation 06 - Adds a provision to clarify that the Center must use de-identified data and that data that may be identifiable based on the size and uniqueness of the population must be suppressed.
 - Regulation 07 - Changes are made for clarity. Instead of defining “nonlongitudinal data requests” and then prohibiting such requests, the regulation simply states that requests that seek data from only one data partner shall be denied by the Center. The regulation also permits an exception in cases where the data partner requests (and the Center agrees) to have the Center fulfill the data request.
- 5. 14.36.05 - Data Collection

- Regulation 01 - Adds the definition of "data partner" (see Chapter 01 and 04) and removes the definition of "state agencies," which is no longer needed.
 - Regulation 02 - Includes a new provision that permits the Center to temporarily collect identity data for the purpose of determining if identity resolution is possible.
 - Regulation 02 - Eliminates the requirement that removed data be reported in the Data Inventory. Instead, a new section D is created that requires the Center to annually report data removed from the Data Inventory.
 - Regulation 05 - Changes the term "third party data" to "other data sources." The examples of "other data sources" are removed since they are not data that are included in the data inventory.
 - Regulation 06 - This regulation is new and clarifies what constitutes a "medical and health record" (which are prohibited) and what information is not considered a medical or health record (and is therefore permissible). This clarification is necessary since the Center receives information that has health implications, but has not been construed by counsel as a health record.
6. 14.36.06 - Center Staff
- Regulation 01 - Clarifies that researchers identified by the Research Branch Director can include staff and graduate students (not just faculty) from any public senior higher education institution (not only from the University System of Maryland). Changes are also made to include additional researchers who have applied for and received approval for a project under the *Project Approval and Management Procedures*.
 - Regulation 03 - Adds to the documents that applicants for staff authorization are required to receive and review, including data sharing agreements, the Labor Confidentiality Certification, and other documents required by the Executive Director.

In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro, Mr. Goldstein confirmed that the MLDS Center would not fulfill a data request that only required data from one partner agency. That request would be referred back to that agency. In response to a question from Dr. Phillips, Mr. Goldstein confirmed that the proposed changes are not the result of legislative changes in the statute.

Board Action: Dr. Phillips made a motion to approve the proposed changes to the Regulations, which was seconded by Mr. Power. The motion was unanimously approved.

Project Application and Management Procedures - Proposed Revisions

Mr. Goldstein began by noting that last year, the Governing Board approved a large-scale revision of the procedures governing the project application and management process. At this meeting there are only a few small changes for the Board to consider. First, in section 3.1, the requirement for a presentation to the internal review team is removed. Instead, a member of the internal review team may request a meeting. Also in section 3.1, the internal review process now states that the reviewers will review the application using the MLDS Internal Review Form, which will be available on the website. Section 3.2 is revised to make the review timeline subject to a schedule posted to the website. In section 3.4, the review considerations are modified to reflect the internal review form. Finally, in section 4.12, the suppression language was modified to refer to the MLDS Center Suppression Guidelines with a link to the data suppression rules page of the website. Staff is in the process of revising the suppression guidelines which will be shared with the Board when they are completed.

Board Action: Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the proposed changes to the *Project Approval and Management Procedures*, which was seconded by Dr. Keys. The motion was unanimously approved.

Projects Applications and Updates

Dr. Henneberger began by noting that this agenda item is to update the Governing Board on projects that have been reviewed and approved by the Executive Director under the *Project Approval and Management Procedures*. The first project was proposed by Ms. Jen Filosa, a graduate student at UMBC. The project focuses on the distribution of CTE programs across Maryland districts and student populations including: which programs are offered across the state, where, and within which districts; changes over time in enrollment in CTE courses leading to concentrator or completer status; the distinction between Maryland high school graduates who are completers versus participants in CTE programs; and the comparison of CTE programming between rural, suburban, and urban school districts, including an analysis of CTE programs by free and reduced price meal rates within each level of urbanicity. The second part of the project will provide a deeper dive into the CTE programs across Maryland with a focus on whether CTE programs provide opportunities for higher poverty students for upward mobility for those students. Upward mobility would be operationalized through local labor market participation in high demand jobs and in higher wage jobs.

The second project was proposed by Dr. Catherine Matta at Brown University. She is a former graduate research assistant at UMBC and has worked with MLDS data. This project will explore the multifaceted effects of the Maryland Community College Promise Scholarship. The project will look at the characteristics of Promise recipients in K12; how the promise scholarship affects access and enrollment in higher education; how it complements or substitutes for existing federal and State financial resources; the effect of the scholarship on college success including course completion, persistence, and college degree attainment; and the trajectories into the labor market measured through workforce outcomes such as employment and wages in Maryland. Additionally, demographic characteristics will be incorporated into all of the research questions.

New Business

There was no new business.

Old Business

There was no old business.

Closing

Dr. Phillips made a motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Dr. Shapiro. The motion was unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,
Ross Goldstein
Executive Director

Approved: [pending]