



Maryland Longitudinal Data System Governing Board
Meeting Minutes
March 4, 2019

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on March 4, 2019, in the Maryland State Department of Education Board Room, at the Nancy S. Grasmick Building. Mr. James Rzepkowski, Vice-Chairman of the Governing Board, called the meeting to order at 9:05 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

The following Governing Board members were in attendance:

Mr. James Rzepkowski, Acting Secretary of the Department of Labor Licensing and Regulation
Dr. Michael J. Kiphart, Director of the Office of Academic Affairs (Designee for Secretary Fielder)
Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach (Designee for Dr. Robert Caret, Chancellor)
Ms. Tina Bjarekull, President, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association
Mr. Christopher J. Biggs, Information Assurance Manager, Raytheon Company
Dr. Farzad Moazzami, Acting Assistant Vice President for Academic Affairs and Associate Professor of Engineering, Morgan State University (Designee for Dr. David Wilson, President)
Dr. Scot Tingle, Assistant Principal, Snow Hill High School
Dr. Jack Smith, Superintendent of Montgomery County Public Schools
Mr. Steven Rizzi, Vice President, PAR Government
Ms. A.J. Brooks, Congressional Relations Officer, Office of Congressional and Legislative Affairs, Department of Veterans Affairs

The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:

Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
Ms. Tejal Cherry, Director of System Management Branch, MLDS Center
Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
Dr. David Blazar, Investigator with the MLDS Center Research Branch and Assistant Professor of Education Policy and Economics at the University of Maryland.
Ms. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center and MHEC Liaison
Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator and MSDE Liaison
Ms. Elizabeth Kameen, Assistant Attorney General
Mr. Roy Enehiroana, Data Analyst and DLLR Liaison
Ms. Jamese Dixon-Bobbitt, Executive Associate, MLDS Center

Approval of the December 14, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Mr. Rzepkowski asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the December 14, 2018 meeting. Mr. Biggs made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Mr. Rizzi. The motion was unanimously approved.

Review of Bylaws and Appointment of Vice-Chairman

Ross Goldstein began by providing an overview of the bylaws and noted that there were no proposed changes or additions. Mr. Goldstein then explained that the vice-chairman position was on a rotating schedule among the State Superintendent of Schools, Secretary of Higher Education, Chancellor of the University System, and Secretary of DLLR. This year is the Secretary of DLLR's year to serve as vice-chairman.

In response to a question from Ms. Bjarekull, Mr. Goldstein responded that the changes to the meeting agenda were done to conform the bylaws to reflect the changes that occurred over time to how the meetings were being conducted.

Mr. Rzepkowski asked for a motion to approve the bylaws, which was made by Ms. Bjarekull and seconded by Dr. Shapiro. The motion was unanimously approved.

Summary of Center Output

Ann Kellogg began the presentation on Center Output by providing an overview of the Center's progress on the *2018-2019 Output Priorities* that were presented to the Board at the June 2018 meeting. Progress has been made on all of the priorities and several have been completed. Work has been done on Critical Workforce Areas, Earnings for High School Graduates, SOAR, and GED by means of a number of different projects:

1. College pathway analyses for Associate's Degree graduates in teaching, nursing and engineering;
2. The Career Preparation Expansion Act Report, which provides earnings information for high school graduates five years after graduation, disaggregated by postsecondary educational attainment;
3. Completion of other required reports; and
4. Updating dashboards with current data and expanding dashboard contents, such as providing postsecondary enrollment information by high school completion type.

Dr. Shapiro thanked the Center staff for their work with Maryland college of education deans to provide insight into teacher pathways.

Ms. Kellogg went on to note that the Center updated or expanded 32 dashboards, completed two reports, and gave 18 presentations. Over the past year, the Center has received 38 data requests, which is on par with last year. So far in 2019, eight data requests were received. The primary themes of the data requests include teachers, GED, healthcare professions, math, and college going. Finally, the source of the requests have been varied with at least one request from each of the Center's key partners (USM, MSDE, MHEC, DLLR, and DLS).

Next, Dr. Angela Henneberger began her presentation on Research Branch Output by reviewing the progress on the *Research Branch Output Priorities*. Significant progress has been made on each of the priorities. Priority 1, (complete and publish in progress research reports) has been achieved through publishing the following completed reports on the MLDS website:

1. Brain Drain in Maryland: Exploring Student Movement from High School to Postsecondary Education and the Workforce;
2. Effects of Dual Enrollment on College and Workforce Outcomes;

3. Remedial Coursework in Maryland Community Colleges: Disentangling Individual and High School Level Predictors; and
4. The Effects of Completing a Health CTE Program on College and Workforce Outcomes.

For Priority 2, (in-depth statistical analyses to support causal inferences on various topics) the most progress has been made on the topic of student and school-level poverty on long-term outcomes. Priority 3, (develop technical documentation to guide research and analysis of the data) has been fulfilled through ongoing work on a technical report addressing how to handle student mobility in MLDS data. Finally, Priority 4, (submit applications for external funding to support these priorities) has been addressed through various grant applications.

Dr. Henneberger reviewed Research Branch output over the past year, which includes:

1. Twelve different outputs in the form of reports, response to requests, and Research Series presentations;
2. Fourteen public presentations, including presentations to the Association for Education Finance and Policy, the Society for Social Work Research, and the Kirwan Commission;
3. Five external research funding applications, including to the Institute of Education Sciences, Spencer Foundation, and National Science Foundation.

Data Gap Analysis

Mr. Goldstein began by noting that the Data Gap Analysis is a compilation of known gaps in MLDS data and the reason those gaps exist. The first version was created at the request of the P20 Council MLDS Workgroup. The goal for today was to review the document and update the Board on the status of different gaps.

Molly Abend stated that there were thirty gaps in the analysis and that six of those gaps have been resolved since the last report, including the MAPCS collection (which reports data on students who complete Maryland Approved Professional Education programs) by MHEC and the receipt of the annual Unemployment Insurance file, which resolves the issues of matching wage records to education records. Ms. Abend went on to note that she has added the “Legislative” category and removed the “Closed” category. Closed was too limiting, since it did not take into consideration the impact of current or future legislation. Instead of closed, “Inactive” will be used to designate gaps that are currently not being addressed. Finally, Ms. Abend noted that PreK-12 still has the highest number of gaps (12), with workforce and postsecondary having the same at eight each.

Mr. Goldstein next updated the Board on recent progress on three of the data gaps.

1. Apprenticeship data - Mr. Goldstein and Dawn O’Croinin met with DLLR to discuss the apprenticeship data. DLLR is transitioning to a new system, RAPIDS, that is managed by the federal government. As such, the federal government has to provide its approval to allow DLLR to share data with the Center. In the meantime, DLLR expressed their willingness to share data from the legacy system, AIMS. Ms. O’Croinin and the DLLR Attorney General are working on a single MOU that will encompass both the AIMS data and the future RAPIDS data sharing.
2. Professional Licensure data - The Career Preparation Expansion Act (CPEA) directs MHEC to collect licensure data from DLLR and the Maryland Department of Health (MDH). MHEC is in

turn, required to provide that data to the Center. The Center is taking the lead on reaching out to DLLR and MDH to identify the data and get the process started.

3. National Certifications - The CPEA also required a company that issues certificates and does business with the State to report to MHEC the information about the individuals receiving the certificates. The Center is also working with MHEC to start to identify those entities and develop a process for collecting the data.

Mr. Rizzi asked about the status of data gaps 25 and 26 regarding the lack of data on private and home schooled students. Mr. Rizzi noted that no progress had been made in obtaining any data. However, it seems unlikely that the Center can't get something from somebody. Mr. Goldstein stated that MSDE may collect some aggregate data, but was not sure how helpful that would be, except as a reference point. Mr. Rizzi asked whether MSDE has to certify that individual children are in school? Dr. Smith responded by noting that if the school is licensed by the State - there is a relationship with the local school system. Dr. Smith also noted that you can find broad numbers about non-public school students on the MSDE website. Ms. Abend noted that the law does not mandate reporting by private schools - but some still do so. Dr. Smith added that home schools are registered with local school systems and there is a monitoring process.

In response to a question from Mr. Biggs, Ms. Kellogg responded that Maryland colleges capture limited student high school information, including: year of graduation; GPA; and name of school. This information is more or less self reported. Staff have discussed using this information to identify people who have gone to private high schools in Maryland.

Dr. Tingle asked about the gap in CTE concentrator data, noting that schools are required to report that information as part of their Perkins reporting and therefore should be available. Ms. Abend responded by noting that concentrators will be reported under the new High School Data Collection (HSDC) and the Center will get start getting that data this year.

Legislative Update

Mr. Goldstein presented three bills under consideration by the General Assembly that directly impact the Center. First, House Bill 704, which is sponsored by Delegate Washington, would remove the restriction against collecting student discipline and juvenile services data. The bill would also appoint the Secretary of Juvenile Services to the Governing Board. Mr. Goldstein noted that there would likely be an amendment to the bill to clarify that the discipline data is limited to K-12 discipline and not higher education discipline, which would be overly burdensome and complex. The Center was asked to submit a fiscal note on the bill. The costs to the Center would be for a liaison position, like the other data partner agencies. In response to a question, Ms. Kellogg responded that the bill received no opposition during the House Ways and Means hearing, only questions about the type of data and whether DJS can disclose the data (which according to OAG, they can). Mr. Rzepkowski noted that the bill had been voted out of committee with amendments.

The second bill is House Bill 1206, which is sponsored by Delegate Kaiser. The bill requires local education agencies to convert student addresses into a Census Block or Census Tract number and send that information MSDE. In turn, MSDE is required to provide that information to the Center. The Center and MSDE will be able to use the information to improve socio-economic information on students. The bill also allows the Center to share a limited amount of student data with Comptroller. The Comptroller

will match that data to state income tax filings and return aggregate information on annual earnings. Because all workers file taxes, this partnership with the Comptroller fill in the wage data gaps caused by the fact that Unemployment Insurance data does not include federal, military, and independent contractor wages. The Center was asked to submit a fiscal note on this bill as well. The costs to the Center associated with this bill include developing a standard methodology for LEAs to use to convert student address into Census Block or Tract numbers and funding for security audits to ensure that the LEA conversion and the transfer of data to the Comptroller are secure and protect data privacy.

The final bill is Senate Bill 493, the *Workforce Data Act* sponsored by Senator Rosapepe. The bill requires employers to include the following information in their UI filings:

- i. Occupation and job title
- ii. Number of Hours worked during the quarter
- iii. The actual location of work (not the business headquarters).

The Center was not asked to submit a fiscal note for this bill. However, the DLLR fiscal note estimated a cost of \$650,000 and highlighted the complexities of the proposed requirements. DLLR would have to make changes to the UI filing system and the State as an employer would need to make changes to its system so it could meet the new reporting requirements. Local government would face the same impact. For the Center, these changes would fill in a lot of information including whether an employee is full or part-time, where the employee is working and what the employee is doing (occupation and job title). Currently, the Center has to make assumptions about the employee based on an employer's industry code. Knowing the classification would provide much more concrete information. In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi, Mr. Goldstein responded that the number of hours will help not just wages earned but how much work goes into earning those wages.

External Research and Grant Funded Projects

Dr. Nancy Shapiro began the presentation on the proposed grant project by noting how appropriate it is to discuss the grant following the prior discussions on data gaps, because this grant can provide resources to help fill many of those gaps. Next Dr. Shapiro explained that she is serving as the principal investigator (PI) on the project, not to lead the research, but because of her prior experience working on large award grants involving multiple institutions. Dr. Angela Henneberger from UMB, Dr. Jane Lincove from UMBC, and Dr. David Blazar from UMCP will lead the research effort and collaborate with the Center on this grant.

Next, Dr. Shapiro asked Dr. Blazar to describe the research questions. Dr. Blazar explained that the project would fill gaps in MLDS to allow for improved substantive research on questions of importance to the State. Dr. Blazar noted that they will look at school based resources, including teachers and access to instructional resources, and how those resources impact long term outcomes in STEM college and career readiness. There are observed differences by socioeconomic status and race and ethnicity, and the project seeks to understand how resources can be used to improve outcomes for those groups and how certain programs can close gaps.

Next Dr. Shapiro presented the research questions that this grant will address.

1. To what degree do public school resources, broadly defined, influence opportunities for students to enter STEM careers?

2. How do inequities in the distribution of public school resources contribute to underrepresentation of female students, black students, Hispanic students, low-income students, and other groups in STEM majors and careers?
3. How can we close the gaps in the pipeline of STEM teachers to meet the needs in a way that supports STEM workforce development?

Ms. Bjarekull asked how the researchers will define inequities in school resources, noting that what is equitable is a very controversial issue. Dr. Shapiro responded that one of the reasons the proposal was developed was in response to issues raised in the Kirwan Commission. One of the most commonsense conclusions of the Commission is that there is more to inequity than schools - it also involves neighborhoods, access to resources, and other examples. The proposed research suggests that we look broader - social services and juvenile services. Dr. Blazar added that a key part of the grant is to bring together stakeholders on a range of topics to address questions like this and make sure it is responsive to various stakeholder groups. Ms. Bjarekull asked whether the intention was to ultimately define inequity. Dr. Blazar responded discussing the topic of access to high quality teachers. There are a lot ways to define that, such as what percent of novice teachers are placed in schools with predominantly low income or minority students. Ultimately, the researchers, will build off of knowledge from the current academic literature - and then convene stakeholders to help define these concepts.

Dr. Smith stated his support for the project and encouraged the team to approach the research by thinking broadly about the issues that schools have control over and the long-term impact of the programs being implemented. Dr. Blazar agreed and noted that the long term analysis is precisely the point of the MLDS Center. However, currently the data does not include enough years to analyze the full lifecycle of students. Dr. Smith agreed noting that understanding not just the outcomes, but the intermediate years is crucial to understanding where gaps begin and how they are exacerbated over time.

Dr. Shapiro next pointed out that the grant is an infrastructure grant, which is somewhat unique for NSF. This grant provides resources to compile all of the additional data sources that are being considered. The grant, which is for \$20 million, would be used to manage the data, ensure privacy and provide technological solutions to continue to improve security.

Mr. Rizzi noted that the project is underpinned by two hypotheses: (1) we are not doing well in STEM because there are inequities in the system that prevent certain students from getting the skills necessary to enter STEM careers; and (2) the teacher workforce does not have the tools to effectively teach STEM. Dr. Shapiro responded that those are the underlying reasons we want to improve the infrastructure to address those questions. Mr. Rizzi then proposed two additional hypothesis: (1) extracurricular activities have an important role in outcomes; and (2) societal and cultural issues create roadblocks, especially for women entering STEM. Dr. Shapiro responded that high risk students need more than just school - they need supports beyond school. If these questions are posed to the MLDS will the data be available to provide answers. That is why we need to improve the infrastructure and provide access to certain data sets.

Dr. Shapiro also noted that the Center has done a lot of work with the Center for Computing Science Education and requested that a presentation be provided at the next meeting on that work.

Next Dr. Shapiro reviewed the data gaps that the project would help address.

- Workforce - federal data; out of state data
- Postsecondary - National Student Clearinghouse (NSC); Accuplacer scores (College Board)

- K-12 - improved measure of student poverty; extension of panel of data to late 1990's to enable research from elementary school into college and into the workforce; discipline data
- Department of Juvenile Services
- Department of Human Resources
- Child in Need of Assistance (Department of Human Services)

Dr. Shapiro noted that these solutions require meaningful partnerships and stakeholder engagement. These partnerships at all levels, including:

- New State partnerships
- District-level partnerships
- Technological solutions, including privacy protecting protocols
- Data linkage innovations
- Examination of ethics
- Data access for researchers and policy makers

Dr. Shapiro discussed the NSF Mid-Scale Research Infrastructure grant, which is looking for big ideas that can serve as a national model and that represent cutting edge of global science and engineering leadership by bringing together diverse disciplinary perspectives. The preliminary application has been submitted and then, if invited, the full proposal is due in May. The team is seeking Board approval to submit a full application if invited to do so. In response to a question from Ms. Bjarekull, Dr. Shapiro responded that a significant amount of the funding is for the MLDS Center. Mr. Goldstein agreed that funding would be available to the Center to obtain data, manage the data, hire additional analysts, improve security and develop new solutions to improve access to data. Dr. Shapiro noted that none of the money would be for USM.

Dr. Henneberger presented the project plan:

- Year 1: Project planning, stakeholder engagement, forming partnerships;
- Year 2-3: Small scale proof of concept at the local level; and
- Year 4-5: Implementation with MLDS.

Throughout the project there will be on going research on STEM student and teacher pipeline and training opportunities for researchers and policy makers.

Dr. Smith made a motion to approve the application to support the grant funded project. The motion was seconded by Dr. Tingle and unanimously approved.

Closing

Mr. Rzepkowski reminded the Governing Board that the next meeting was on June 14th. Mr. Biggs made a motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Ms. Brooks. The meeting concluded at 10:20 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Ross Goldstein
Executive Director

Approved: June 14, 2019