



**Maryland Longitudinal Data System Governing Board
Meeting Minutes for June 10, 2022**

The meeting of the Maryland Longitudinal Data System (MLDS) Governing Board was held on June 10, 2022, both in-person and via teleconference. Dr. Fielder, Chairman of the Governing Board, called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and noted that a quorum was present.

The following Governing Board members were in attendance:

Dr. James Fielder, Secretary of Higher Education and Chairman
Mr. Sam Abed, Secretary, Department of Juvenile Services
Mr. Mohammed Choudhury, State Superintendent of Schools (Dr. Sylvia Lawson, Deputy Superintendent for School Effectiveness, attended part of the meeting as Mr. Choudhury's designee)
Dr. Nancy Shapiro, Associate Vice-Chancellor for Education & Outreach (Designee for Dr. Jay Perman, Chancellor)
Mr. Gregory James, Deputy Secretary for Operations, Department of Human Services (Designee for Secretary Padilla)
Dr. Angela Sherman, Vice President for Academic Affairs, Maryland Independent Colleges and Universities Association (Designee for Ms. Sara Fidler, President)
Mr. Jason Dykstra, Executive Director, Instructional Data Division, Anne Arundel County Public Schools
Dr. Susan Sterett, Professor, University of Maryland, Baltimore County
Mr. Maurice Good, Program Director, Maryland New Directions
Mr. Chris Biggs, Information Assurance Manager, Raytheon Company
Mr. Steven Rizzi, Vice President, PAR Government

The following MLDS Center staff were in attendance:

Mr. Ross Goldstein, Executive Director, MLDS Center
Ms. Tejal Cherry, Director of System Management Branch, MLDS Center
Dr. Angela Henneberger, Director of Research, MLDS Center and Research Assistant Professor, University of Maryland, School of Social Work
Dr. Ann Kellogg, Director of Reporting Services, MLDS Center, and MHEC Liaison
Ms. Molly Abend, Data Management Coordinator, MLDS Center, and MSDE Liaison
Ms. Dawn Luedtke, Assistant Attorney General
Mr. Roy Enehiroana, Data Analyst, MLDS Center, and Department of Labor Liaison
Ms. James Dixon-Bobbitt, Executive Associate, MLDS Center

Approval of the December 10, 2021, Meeting Minutes

Dr. Fielder called the meeting to order and asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the March 11, 2022 meeting. Mr. Biggs made a motion to approve the minutes, which was seconded by Mr. Good. The motion was unanimously approved.

Center Output

Dr. Ann Kellogg explained that the Center Output presentation will focus on the Center's research and reporting priorities for 2022-2023. The priorities were developed in close consultation with stakeholders, including representatives of the Governing Board members. The Reporting Services' priorities are to expand dashboards, including adding new data points, such as majors pursued in college, to high school to college dashboards. Last year, wage data was added to this dashboard set and during the coming year, the plan is to add the labor sector. Dr. Kellogg noted that expansion to the dual enrollment dashboard series based on a recently completed research project is also planned for next year. Dr. Kellogg also noted that the Center now has approximately 70 dashboards, which require significant effort to maintain and update. The next priority is the required annual output the Center produces each year; some tied to legislation and others to address reporting needs of agency partners and other stakeholders. Another priority is to explore new data sources and identify opportunities to utilize that data to add to the dashboard and reports. Finally, Dr. Kellogg noted that work will continue on the Career Preparation Expansion Reports, including going back to the original report and examining outcomes for that cohort, 10 years after high school graduation.

In response to a question from Mr. Biggs about managing reporting responsibilities, Dr. Kellogg responded that she has scaled back reports to only address the minimum requirements. For example, while prior Annual Dual Enrollment Reports went into a lot of detail and additional analysis, this year the report only addressed the two required reporting criteria. Dr. Fielder also noted that reporting requirements established by the legislature add up to create a lot of work and require careful management.

Next, Dr. Henneberger provided the Research Branch Priorities for 2022-2023. She also noted that the priorities are formed with stakeholders and reviewed by the Research and Policy Advisory Board. The Research Branch Priorities include four overarching priorities:

1. The first priority is to conduct research using advanced statistical analyses with a commitment to social justice and equity to inform policy. There are a number of specific projects included under this priority, many of which have already begun. Dr. Henneberger highlighted a project analyzing how K-12 discipline and juvenile services involvement overlap and impact outcomes and a project to analyze critical workforce areas including teaching, STEM, and health care.
2. The second priority area is to build research capacity by providing technical and methodological documentation on Center data. This includes researching data science methods, student mobility, multilevel modeling, and in-depth analysis of wage data.
3. The third priority is to establish and maintain diverse and inclusive partnerships. Dr. Henneberger noted the establishment and ongoing work to include researchers from Morgan State University as part of the Research Branch and work with various external researchers and partnerships with new state agencies.
4. The final priority for the Research Branch is to seek external funding to support the work on the other priorities.

In response to a question from Dr. Fielder, Mr. Goldstein responded that the bill to establish the *Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis in Maryland* did pass and it is on the Center's list of priorities, noting that an interim report is due in December and a final report the following December. Dr. Shapiro asked about working with the Accountability and Oversight Board. Mr. Goldstein responded

that staff met with Rachel Hise, Executive Director of the Board, to discuss an upcoming report on teacher certification due in July and to discuss how the Center can be of assistance to the Board.

Data Inventory

Ms. Abend began by discussing the three additional elements from the Microsoft certification testing program that are proposed for inclusion in the *Data Inventory*. Staff have determined that these data elements would be useful for better understanding the Microsoft testing program. The first data element is *Test Modality*, which indicates whether the test was taken at a testing center or using a home delivery method. The second data element is *License or Voucher*, which provides an indication of financial need. The final data element is *Maryland Residence*, which indicates whether the student is a Maryland resident (regardless of whether the student took the test outside of the state).

Next, Ms. Abend noted that there is one additional data element from Correctional Education, which is the *Student Identification Number*. This identification number does not change per record regardless of how many times the inmate is arrested and will be routinely collected beginning in March 2022.

Ms. Abend then discussed the newly created *Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis in Maryland*. As previously noted, there is an initial, interim report due in December and the Center will need to ask for approval on health care related data inventory elements prior to the next MLDS Governing Board meeting held in September. This will enable MLDS Center staff the time needed to load data and conduct analyses to support the reporting requirements. The MLDS Center is currently working on finalizing the Data Sharing Agreement with the 22 independent health care boards and commissions. As soon as the MLDS Center is able to identify the necessary health care license data elements, staff will propose them to the Board for approval (via a special meeting or by polling the members).

Board Action: Mr. Biggs made a motion to approve the proposed data elements for inclusion in the data inventory, which was seconded by Mr. Rizzi. The motion was unanimously approved.

Data Collection Calendar

Ms. Abend presented the *Data Collection Calendar for 2022-2023* and noted that it is similar to the prior year's calendar. However, there are a few additions including:

1. MSDE - Census Block and Tract Collection, which starts this fall;
2. MHEC - non-credit workforce completer program data;
3. Labor - currently there are no changes for Labor, but Ms. Abend anticipates adding different collections under WDQI Grant.
4. DJS - Assist merges and administrative support tools have been added to the calendar and provide information on identity mergers in the Assist system.
5. DHS - Out-of-home services data have been included in the calendar as a collection under development.

In response to a question from Dr. Shapiro about Kindergarten Readiness Assessment (KRA) data, Ms. Abend explained that MSDE has the files and is waiting for one year of data to be coded and verified. She also stated that she is working on developing a memorandum on the KRA data to explain how the test was administered (which changed over time).

Board Action: Mr. James made a motion to approve the proposed Data Collection Calendar, which was seconded by Dr. Shapiro. The motion was unanimously approved.

Data Gap Analysis

Ms. Abend began by noting that the Data Gap Analysis is reviewed and updated every year and is an important document to better inform stakeholders about the MLDS data and its gaps. The Data Gap Analysis is organized by sector: there is a description of the gap, the reason for the gap, the impact of the gap on research and analysis; and the status of filling the gap. Ms. Abend noted that the Center is currently actively working on resolving 10 gaps (compared to 4 last year).

Next, Ms. Abend noted that the staff has prioritized the data gaps that are achievable and/or highly important to accurately analyze and report on student and workforce outcomes over time. These are the same priorities as last year.

1. PK-12 applicants for teacher certification
2. Licensure from Labor, MDH health occupation boards and commissions, and other license granting agencies
3. Socioeconomic status for PK-12 students
4. Unemployment applications and benefits
5. Social determinants (e.g. CINA, Department of Health)
6. Federal and military employees

Finally, Ms. Abend noted that staff created a new appendix on *COVID-19 Considerations and Missing and/or Incomplete Data Gaps*. This addition captures important facts about and impacts of COVID-19 on the data contained in the MLDS. This list may grow and change as we learn more about the impacts and degree to which data may need to be examined.

In response to a question from Dr. Fielder about the COVID-19 Appendix, Ms. Abend explained that the goal of the appendix was to document changes that might be seen in the data as a result of COVID-19. For example, changes in attendance, assessments and enrollment. The appendix also provides important dates, such as the date the Governor signed the order for the shutdown. Another example is the inclusion of information on a judicial order limiting youth detentions or commitments, which helps explain changes in DJS data.

Mr. Rizzi asked about data relating to modes of instruction that would allow researchers to understand what methods were successful. Ms. Abend responded that there is limited data on that subject and it would require a researcher to work directly with LEAs to gain school level data on how instruction was provided during COVID-19. Mr. Rizzi commented that if there isn't at least a rudimentary understanding of how education was provided, researchers will not be able to understand outcomes because they would not be able to understand the circumstances of the student. Ms. Abend agreed with Mr. Rizzi's concerns and noted that this is the reason the appendix was created.

In response to a question from Mr. Biggs about parents pulling kids out of public school in favor of private school or homeschooling, Ms. Abend responded that MSDE has analyzed this issue and identified a trend in reduced enrollment. Dr. Fielder also noted that there are similar issues at the postsecondary level; enrollment patterns have changed and there is little information about measures that may have been taken to provide access to education by the colleges.

Finally, Dr. Sterett commented on the difficulty of these issues for research and noted that this is not wholly in the state's control. One avenue may be to consider cross-state comparisons. For example, the state of Maine kept schools open and in-person and a comparison may allow researchers to understand the

impacts of Maryland's closures. There are, however, selection issues when conducting this type of comparison.

Census Project Update

Ms. Abend began by noting that at the last meeting the Board was provided with an update on the Census Block and Tract data collection that the Center is working on with MSDE. This data collection was required pursuant to a 2019 bill that requires the MLDS Center to develop a protocol for a county board to convert a student's home address and geolocation information into Census tract and block numbers. That information is then sent to MSDE, which in turn provides it to the Center. Geolocation data at the student level enables the MLDS Center to use factors in the U.S. Census Bureau's American Community Survey to better understand the demographic and socioeconomic conditions of each Census tract and block.

To date, the Center along with MSDE convened a workgroup that met several times and completed a pilot of the address conversion protocol. The pilot was successful and had a 92% conversion rate. For the rollout to all of the LEAs, the Center will be conducting two informational webinars (June 6th and 15th) and will schedule individual meetings with each LEA to answer individual questions and provide any needed assistance. Technical support will also be provided throughout the summer. Finally, the website will be updated with an information page about this data collection and links to the protocol.

In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi about the availability of geospatial information from other sectors, Ms. Abend responded that the Center will look into what address information it has from Labor and higher education. Mr. Rizzi noted that even if it wasn't as specific as Census block and tract information, any information on location would help researchers understand how students move throughout the state over time.

Legislation

2022 Session Review

Mr. Goldstein provided an overview and final status of legislation the Center was tracking during the 2022 session.

1. SB 498 / HB 132 - *Education - Student Horizon Database and Scorecard (Students Right to Know Act of 2022)* - This bill, which was withdrawn mid-session, required the MSDE (with input from MLDS Center and MHEC) to annually collect and report information related to colleges, private career schools, and the student outcomes at those institutions (including workforce outcomes). The bill was withdrawn.
2. SB 440 / HB 625 (Chapters 707 and 708) - *Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis in Maryland - Establishment* - This bill, which passed, establishes the Commission to Study the Health Care Workforce Crisis in Maryland. The MLDS Center was included on the Commission and will provide reporting and analyses to assist the Commission.
3. SB 870 / HB 1276 (Chapter 169 and 170) - *Baltimore City Youth Data Hub - Establishment* - This bill, which also passed, establishes a data hub in the Baltimore City Mayor's office. The system will consist of data on Baltimore City children. Some of this data is duplicative of what the MLDS contains. This legislation has no impact on the Center.
4. SB 277/ HB 127 - *Maryland Longitudinal Data System Center - Division of Correction - Data Requirement* - This bill, which did not pass, required the Division of Correction (DOC) within the Department of Public Safety and Correctional Services to provide the MLDS with records and

other information related to current and former Maryland inmates. In turn, the MLDS Center was required to collect and maintain that information and add to its research and reporting responsibilities, including research on the impact of prison-based education or training programs (including work release or other transition programs) on workforce outcomes and future recidivism. The bill added the Secretary of the Department of Public Safety and Corrections Services to the MLDS Governing Board.

5. SB 763 (Chapter 141) - *Public Safety and Criminal Procedure - Collection, Reporting, and Publication of Criminal Case and Prosecutorial Information* - This bill, which passed, was amended late in the session to remove the restriction in Ed. Art. § 24-701 which prohibited the MLDS Center from having criminal history data and child in need of assistance (CINA) data. Removing this restriction will allow the Center to collect correctional services data.

Mr. Abed noted that he met with the Baltimore City Criminal Justice Coordinating Council about the Data Hub. He informed them that the data was duplicative of the data provided to the MLDS Center and that they should consider making a research proposal instead of a new duplicative data system.

In response to a question from Mr. Biggs about the Health Care Workforce Commission, Mr. Goldstein stated that the Center can provide an analysis of the pathway from education to certification to the workforce and the median wages earned.

In response to a question from Dr. Fielder about the data to be collected by the Baltimore City Youth Data Hub, Mr. Goldstein said this includes most of the data the Center collects on education, juvenile justice, and child welfare, and includes some additional information about birth weight, maternal health, and additional socioeconomic data.

2023 Proposals and Recommendations

Mr. Goldstein began by explaining that in 2021, legislation ([Chapter 577](#)) was passed that amended Education Article § 7-212(c), Annotated Code of Maryland, to establish a requirement for County Boards to report to the MLDS Center on:

1. The number of students who completed and submitted the FAFSA
2. The number of students who did not complete and submit the FAFSA
3. The number of students who completed the FAFSA by the deadline for eligibility for State financial aid.

The MLDS Center is required to compile that information and report it to the General Assembly. This provision, as currently written, presents two issues.

The first issue is whether the current scheme is the most efficient and informative method to accomplish the goal of providing the General Assembly with information on this topic. In order for an LEA to obtain FAFSA completion information for their high school students, they must submit a roster of students to MHEC's College Aid Processing System (MDCAPS). MDCAPS is populated with FAFSA application information provided by the federal government. One possible alternative approach would be for the MLDS Center to have direct access to the FAFSA application data in MDCAPS. This access would allow the Center to directly collect FAFSA completion information at the student level and incorporate the

FAFSA completion data into the MLDS. This approach would provide for a more in-depth analysis and reporting while also removing an additional reporting requirement from the LEAs. Currently, MHEC's counsel is reviewing whether the MLDS Center can be provided MDCAPS access.

The second issue is whether, as currently written, the reporting requirement is properly assigned to the MLDS Center. First, the data that the LEAs are required to provide to the MLDS Center are aggregate data, not unit record student data. This means that the Center cannot incorporate those data in the MLDS or analyze the data for cross-sector, longitudinal outcomes (instead, this requirement is for a single sector report). Second, the law requires the MLDS Center to collect data directly from the LEAs. However, MSDE is the agency that LEAs report to; MSDE has the administrative expertise and oversight to effectively manage data collections.

At this time, there is no specific proposal. As stated previously, staff are waiting for a determination on whether and how the MLDS Center can have access to the FAFSA completion data in MDCAPS. Accordingly, the purpose of this memorandum is to inform the Board about these issues and determine whether the Board thinks that a legislative change should be pursued.

Ms. Fidler stated that it is worth having a conversation about the proper role of the MLDS Center, noting her concern that this requirement takes a step in the direction of having the MLDS Center becoming the research arm of the State. Mr. Goldstein responded that the MLDS Center has worked hard to stay in its lane, to only engage in work that requires longitudinal analyses, and not conduct research and reporting that could otherwise be conducted by its partner agencies using their own data. For this topic, if the MLDS Center can collect the data as unit record data, longitudinal analysis would be possible. In other words, there could be a role for the Center with this issue - but currently, this is not the right role. Mr. Dykstra stated his support for a legislative change, noting that the Center should not collect data from the LEAs, that the reporting requirement would be burdensome, and questioned whether the FAFSA information would include students if they do not select a Maryland college. Dr. Kellogg noted that MHEC collects FAFSA data based on both the college selected and the student's residency, which would provide information for all Maryland students completing a FAFSA. Ms. Luedtke stated that under State law, the MLDS Center is authorized to collect data directly from LEAs, it just has not been done. Mr. Goldstein noted that data collection is a full time job and beyond the MLDS Center's resources.

Finally, Mr. Goldstein stated that it appeared that there is a consensus among the Board that a change is necessary and therefore he will come back with a legislative proposal to address the issues discussed.

FY 2023 Budget

Mr. Goldstein began by noting that the MLDS Center's general operating budget for fiscal year 2023 is \$2.54 million. This represents a small increase of \$144,055 from last year. As in past years the breakdown is as follows:

1. 63% of the Center's funds are used for staff salaries
2. 18% Research Branch
3. 12% IT consulting
4. 6% support for IT systems

5. 1% office needs

In comparison to FY 22, FY 23 has an increase in Object 01 - Salaries and slight decrease in Object 08 - Contracts. This is because in prior years, Ann Kellogg's PIN was in the MHEC budget. MHEC paid Dr. Kellogg's salary and the Center reimbursed MHEC from Object 08. During FY 22, the PIN reverted back to MLDS. Accordingly, part of the salary line item increase is a result of the fact that this additional employee salary is added to Object 01. The other cause of the increase in Object 01 is due to the fact that DBM eliminated the usual vacancy rate deduction, because the Center generally has little or no vacancies. The slight decrease in Object 08 is more than offset by the fact that funds do not have to be allocated to reimbursing MHEC. In addition, the Center entered into a new IT services contract with Vedasoft, Inc., for a Data Analyst and Database Administrator. By re-bidding the contract the Center was able to get a more favorable price which allows us to fund these resources (one full-time and one part-time) for the same cost that it took to fund one full-time resource under the old contract. Through these savings, there were funds available to seek an increase of \$110,000 for the Research Branch budget. The Research Branch is starting the final year of a three year agreement. The prior two years the research budget was held at \$346,460 pursuant to a requirement by the Department of Budget and Management (DBM). This year, it appears that we will be able to obtain DBM approval to add the additional funds (\$110,000) to the research budget to add resources to help meet the Center's research and reporting needs.

Finally, Mr. Goldstein reported that the Center will begin spending federal funds provided by the WDQI Grant. The funds will be managed by the Maryland Department of Labor. The Center is finalizing a procurement for two positions: a data analyst and a business analyst. The amount spent this year may change once the final cost of the contract is determined. This project will provide a lot of important information about the State's workforce development efforts.

Board Action: Dr. Shapiro made a motion to approve the FY 2023 Budget plan, which was seconded by Mr. Good. The motion was unanimously approved.

External Research - Applications and Updates

Dr. Henneberger explained that the purpose of this agenda item is to provide an update on an external research project on the effects of high school grade retention on postsecondary outcomes that was presented to the Research and Policy Advisory Board and recommended to and approved by the Executive Director via the expedited review process.

Ms. Taylor Delaney, a graduate student at American University, submitted the external research proposal to study the effects of grade retention (i.e., repeating a grade) in high school on college and career outcomes. Variation exists across the State in terms of the policies for grade retention, including variation by local school system and by high school. This project will use advanced statistical methods to examine the effects of grade retention in high school on high school graduation, college, and career outcomes. Further, the project will examine how relationships vary by different retention and promotion policies within the State. The findings from this study will provide a better understanding of how impacts on student outcomes vary by retention policy and will provide implications for future policy shifts to improve student outcomes. Dr. David Blazar, MLDS Research Branch member, is sponsoring this external research project.

In response to a question from Dr. Fielder about the timeline for this project, Dr. Henneberger stated that

it would take approximately one year. In response to a question from Mr. Rizzi about funding, Dr. Henneberger noted there would not be any MLDS funds or external funds applied to this project. It is possible that, as a graduate student, American University provides funding for her time. Dr. Henneberger also noted that the student would be required to complete the Center's *Procedures for Staff Authorization and Access* before having access to the data.

Old Business

Bylaws

Mr. Goldstein noted that the bylaws were discussed at the last meeting, but were put on hold until Mr. Choudhury could be informed of his designation as the Board's Vice-Chair for 2022. In addition to the Vice-Chair, there were other proposed changes under consideration. The biggest change was the addition of Article 7. State law requires the Board to establish the organizational placement and location of the Center. The purpose of this new provision is to codify the organizational placement and location decisions that were made by the Board. The organizational structure decisions include locating the MLDS Center headquarters at UMB, establishing the Research Branch with the University of Maryland, School of Social Work, and providing funding for a director, statistician, and faculty, staff, and students from MD Public colleges and universities to perform projects. The organizational decisions also include the liaisons with the original partner agencies and the location and hosting of the data system at DoIT's enterprise system. The fact that this is added to the bylaws does not mean these decisions cannot be changed. The Board has the authority to update bylaws at any time.

The rest of the changes are primarily technical, including adding the Secretary of Human Services (DHS) to the Vice-Chair rotation schedule, moving the rotation schedule to § 2.3C, removing the requirement to establish an implementation plan since that has already been accomplished, removing a redundant provision, and added the CIO for DHS to the Cybersecurity Subcommittee.

Board Action: Mr. Abed made a motion to approve the proposed data elements for inclusion in the data inventory, which was seconded by Mr. Biggs. The motion was unanimously approved.

New Business

There was no new business.

Closing

Dr. Fielder stated that Mr. Biggs and Mr. Rizzi are at the end of their terms as members of the Governing Board. They have been asked to continue to serve until replaced by the Governor. Dr. Fielder thanked them for their support, service and participation. Mr. Choudhury made a motion to adjourn the meeting, which was seconded by Mr. James. The motion was unanimously approved.

Respectfully submitted,
Ross Goldstein
Executive Director

Approved: *September 9, 2022*